

Sierra Club Lake Group

15995 Lucy Circle Lower Lake, CA 95457

November 6, 2006

Penelope Shibley
Community Development Department
Planning Division
255 N. Forbes Street
Lakeport, CA 95453

RE: Bonavita Estates, SD 05-10

Dear Ms. Shibley:

The Lake Group recommends very strongly that this application not be allowed to proceed without the detailed investigation of its consequences that nothing less than a full Environmental Impact Report can provide. Our concerns include:

Wetland habitat. Although the proposed pond will provide a larger wetland acreage (of a sort) than exists on the property at present, the habitat created will be very different, and unless carefully crafted will support a less diverse array of plant and animal life. These consequences need to be investigated in detail, and appropriate mitigation specified accordingly.

Groundwater depletion. The water needed to fill a 10 acre lake could potentially deplete the aquifer to an extent that seriously impacts other users, whose rights precede those of the Bonavita developers.

Access. Although no detailed map is available to me, it is evident that all vehicular access will have to take place through a narrow corridor fronting on Butts Canyon Road. Extra traffic load from residents is not of concern, and that imposed by attendance at special events of only concern, but the fact that a broad swath of flood zone stretches across this single means of egress is bothersome indeed.

Air quality. The proposal to excavate and transport such massive quantities (ca 100,000 yards) of serpentine soil has the potential for substantial negative impacts on the clean air that is one of Lake County's most precious possessions.

Land use. The Citizens Advisory Committee charged with preparing the Middletown Area Plan has recommended Urban Growth Boundaries that do not incorporate this property. It would be highly desirable for those concerned citizens to have the opportunity for continued involvement in its destiny, as enabled by the open comment periods and public hearings provided by the EIR process.

The Sierra Club is not necessarily in opposition to this project, which will provide recreational opportunities that are in short supply in the vicinity, and will also lead to the preservation of substantial areas of public open space. But we do think that

approval should be delayed until questions about its impacts to the environment can be answered in a comprehensive manner, and until its appropriate niche in what might be called Greater Middletown can be determined. Meeting those objectives without an EIR hardly seems possible, and in our opinion an attempt to do so is fraught with hazard.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Victoria Brandon". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

- . Victoria Brandon
- . Sierra Club Lake Group Chair